

## Cation ordering in synthetic and natural Ni-Mg olivine

DAVID L. BISH<sup>1</sup>

*Department of Geological Sciences  
Harvard University  
Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138*

### Abstract

The crystal structures of natural liebenbergite— $(\text{Ni}_{1.52}\text{Co}_{0.05}\text{Fe}_{0.09}\text{Mg}_{0.34})\text{SiO}_4$ —from Barberton, South Africa, and of synthetic liebenbergite— $(\text{Ni}_{1.16}\text{Mg}_{0.84})\text{SiO}_4$ —synthesized at 500°C, have been studied in order to determine the intracrystalline Ni-Mg distribution. The natural liebenbergite is fully ordered, with M1 occupied only by Ni, whereas the synthetic sample is only partially ordered with  $K_D = [\text{Mg}(\text{M2}) \cdot \text{Ni}(\text{M1})]/[\text{Ni}(\text{M2}) \cdot \text{Mg}(\text{M1})] = 9.9(4)$ ,  $\Delta G_{ex}^{\circ} = -3.5$  kcal/mole. Comparison with the results of Rajamani *et al.* (1975), who found  $K_D = 9.2(2)$  and  $\Delta G_{ex}^{\circ} = -6.9$  kcal/mole for a sample synthesized at 1280°C, implies that the 500°C synthetic sample in the present study crystallized metastably in a disordered or partially ordered state and ordering proceeded slowly.

Although site size effects are small in Fe-Mg, Ni-Mg, and Co-Mg olivines, the crystal field stabilization energy is important in determining the observed cation distribution in Ni-Mg and Co-Mg olivines. Electronegativity or covalency effects are known only qualitatively, but there is a preference of less electronegative ions (Mg, Ca) for M2.

Ordering of Ni into the M1 site of olivine should appreciably affect Ni partitioning between olivine and melt, and activity-composition relations have been examined assuming ideal solution behavior. Deviations from Raoult's law increase with increasing order, but variations in activity coefficients are less than 10 percent below 10 mole% Ni.

### Introduction

Although nickel is a common and important minor constituent in olivines, liebenbergite, the nickel-rich olivine, has been found only in the unusual Bon Accord deposit in Barberton, South Africa. The material at Bon Accord originally filled interstices between trevorite grains in the assemblage trevorite-nickel serpentine-nickel ludwigite-bunsenite-violarite-millerite-gaspeite-nimite but is now almost completely replaced by secondary nickel serpentine. Only small irregular crystals remain in the serpentine matrix (de Waal and Calk, 1973). The liebenbergite appears to have formed at about 730°C and less than 2 kbar during thermal metamorphism, possibly of a nickel-rich meteorite (de Waal, 1978). I have obtained crystals of liebenbergite through the courtesy of Dr. de Waal.

The natural occurrence of liebenbergite presents us with the unique opportunity to examine a mineral

that previously had been studied in synthetic form only (e.g. Rajamani *et al.*, 1975). The natural sample equilibrated over a long period at a fairly low temperature (730°C), so it should possess an equilibrium distribution of cations. Typical synthesis experiments are of short duration at high temperature. For example, the Ni-Mg olivine examined by Rajamani *et al.* (1975) was crystallized at 1280°C and cooled in several days yielding a zoned crystal. The authors questioned whether the observed  $K_D = [\text{Mg}(\text{M2}) \cdot \text{Ni}(\text{M1})]/[\text{Ni}(\text{M2}) \cdot \text{Mg}(\text{M1})]$ , represented an equilibrium distribution of cations.

During a study of hydrous nickel-magnesium silicates (Brindley *et al.*, 1979), euhedral crystals of liebenbergite were synthesized by reacting natural pimelite (nickel-magnesium talc) at 500°C and 2.1 kbar for 4 weeks. These crystals should differ significantly from the products of short-term reactions at temperatures in excess of 1200°C.

Numerous studies have focused on the nature and causes of intracrystalline cation distributions in natural and synthetic olivines (see Rajamani *et al.*, 1975, for a summary). In an attempt to understand order-

<sup>1</sup> Present address: Los Alamos National Laboratory, Geosciences Division, MS 978, Los Alamos, New Mexico 87545.

## APPENDIX A

## OBSERVED AND CALCULATED STRUCTURE FACTORS FOR Ni-Mg OLIVINE (Synthetic)

$h=0, k=0$	$h=0, k=6$	$h=0, k=12$	$h=1, k=1$	$h=1, k=4$	$h=1, k=7$
$\ell$	$F_O$	$F_C$	$\ell$	$F_O$	$F_C$
2	16	16	5	45	43
6	17	17	6	87	82
8	75	75	7	29	27
10	13	13	8	4	4
			9	25	23
$h=0, k=2$	10	41	39	$h=0, k=14$	
0	62	61	$h=0, k=8$	0	29
1	44	41		1	13
2	71	71	0	50	48
3	5	5	1	6	6
4	43	40	2	47	45
5	33	31	3	18	18
6	50	47	4	41	40
7	3	2	5	4	3
8	26	25	6	33	31
9	18	17	7	16	15
10	29	27	8	27	26
11	1	1	9	4	3
			10	22	21
$h=0, k=4$		$h=0, k=10$	3	15	17
0	60	58	4	6	7
1	46	44	0	56	54
2	49	47	1	44	42
3	60	56	2	12	12
4	53	49	3	29	28
5	22	20	4	48	46
6	36	34	5	37	36
7	36	34	6	13	12
8	32	29	7	14	14
9	9	9	8	33	33
10	24	22	9	23	22
11	18	17		$h=1, k=0$	
$h=0, k=6$		$h=0, k=12$	1	23	26
0	21	20	0	57	58
1	71	68	1	46	46
3	55	53	2	39	39
4	7	6	3	45	45
			11	3	3



$h= 2, k= 16$	$h= 3, k= 2$	$h= 3, k= 6$	$h= 3, k= 10$	$h= 3, k= 14$	$h= 4, k= 1$
$\ell \ F_0 \ F_C$					
0 12 13	4 24 26	0 2 2	0 1 1	3 8 9	5 5 5
1 6 6	5 14 15	1 29 28	1 32 31	4 7 7	6 14 15
2 47 48	6 29 31	2 4 4	2 16 15	5 6 6	7 7 8
3 3 2	7 3 3	3 14 14	3 23 23	6 14 14	8 9 9
4 10 10	8 18 20	4 0 0	4 2 2		9 3 1
5 7 8	9 8 8	5 29 28	5 28 27	$h= 3, k= 15$	10 5 5
	10 11 12	6 3 2	6 8 8	0 35 36	$h= 4, k= 2$
$h= 2, k= 17$		7 5 5	7 13 13	1 11 11	
0 8 9	$h= 3, k= 3$	8 1 1	8 5 4	2 6 6	0 17 19
1 7 8	0 66 70	9 18 17		3 10 10	1 9 10
2 3 3	1 46 48	10 2 0	$h= 3, k= 11$	4 32 33	2 56 62
3 7 7	2 23 24		0 49 48	5 9 9	3 16 17
4 6 7	3 40 41	$h= 3, k= 7$	1 3 3	6 6 7	4 15 17
	4 53 55	0 79 79	2 21 21		5 1 1
$h= 2, k= 18$	5 30 31	1 10 10	3 7 7	$h= 3, k= 16$	6 38 42
0 20 22	6 19 19	2 23 23	4 40 40		7 12 13
1 6 7	7 22 23	3 12 12	5 2 1	0 1 1	8 13 14
2 7 7	8 33 34	4 62 61	6 16 16	1 15 15	9 1 1
3 7 8	9 15 17	5 4 4	7 7 7	2 8 8	10 25 27
	10 13 14	6 15 14	8 27 26	3 18 19	
		7 9 8		4 1 1	$h= 4, k= 3$
$h= 3, k= 0$	$h= 3, k= 4$	8 36 35	$h= 3, k= 12$	5 9 9	0 17 18
1 17 20	0 50 52	9 3 2	0 11 11	$h= 3, k= 17$	1 2 2
3 29 33	1 32 32		1 18 18	0 20 20	2 17 19
5 6 6	2 18 17	$h= 3, k= 8$	2 4 5	1 9 9	3 8 9
7 21 24	3 34 35	0 47 46	3 23 23	2 21 22	4 15 15
9 2 1	4 33 34	1 6 5	4 8 9	3 6 6	5 4 4
$h= 3, k= 1$	5 17 18	2 20 18	5 8 8		6 12 12
6 16 16	3 2 2	6 5 4		$h= 3, k= 1^\circ$	7 8 8
0 56 62	7 22 22	4 35 34	7 20 20		8 9 8
1 30 33	8 14 14	5 6 6	8 4 5	0 8 9	9 4 3
2 61 70	9 9 9	6 17 17		1 11 12	
3 20 22	10 13 13	7 1 0	$h= 3, k= 13$		$h= 4, k= 4$
4 38 43		8 17 16		$h= 4, k= 0$	0 59 61
5 22 25	$h= 3, k= 5$	9 4 4	0 15 15	1 22 23	1 9 9
6 36 41	0 39 40		1 9 9	2 70 78	2 13 14
7 9 10	1 15 15	$h= 3, k= 9$	2 47 48	3 10 10	3 15 16
8 21 23	2 68 68	0 2 2	4 12 12	6 10 11	4 49 50
9 12 13	3 19 19	1 9 9	5 5 6	8 37 41	
10 19 22	4 31 30	2 63 62	6 36 35	10 3 3	5 2 1
	5 6 6	3 8 8	7 8 7	$h= 4, k= 1$	6 12 13
$h= 3, k= 2$	6 42 42	4 4 3		0 10 11	7 12 13
0 26 27	7 13 13	5 8 7	$h= 3, k= 14$	1 8 8	8 32 33
1 15 16	8 17 17	6 47 46	0 6 6	2 26 28	
2 57 63	9 3 2	7 5 5	1 8 8	3 10 11	
3 8 8	10 23 23	8 5 5	2 22 23	4 11 11	
		9 4 4			

$h = 4, k = 5$	$h = 4, k = 9$	$h = 4, k = 13$	$h = 5, k = 1$	$h = 5, k = 5$	$h = 5, k = 9$									
$\ell$	$F_0$	$F_C$	$\ell$	$F_0$	$F_C$	$\ell$	$F_0$	$F_C$	$\ell$	$F_0$	$F_C$	$\ell$	$F_0$	$F_C$
0 23 23	0 13 13	3 2 2	5 20 20	2 58 60	3 7 6									
1 22 22	1 10 10	4 2 2	6 20 21	3 17 17	4 25 26									
2 6 5	2 10 9	5 3 3	7 25 26	4 3 3	5 8 8									
3 18 18	3 4 3	6 4 4	8 23 24	5 22 23	6 27 27									
4 17 16	4 11 10		9 10 11	6 42 44	7 3 3									
5 18 18	5 12 11	$h = 4, k = 14$		7 10 9										
6 6 6	6 8 7	0 30 31	$h = 5, k = 2$	8 5 5	$h = 5, k = 10$									
7 10 10	7 1 0	1 6 6	0 16 17											
8 7 7	8 5 6	2 14 14	1 12 12	$h = 5, k = 6$	0 1 2									
9 10 10		3 10 10	2 2 1	1 4 4	1 2 2									
		$h = 4, k = 10$	0 2 3	3 5 5	8 8 8									
$h = 4, k = 6$	0 21 21	5 2 2	4 11 11	2 4 0	4 0 0									
0 34 35	1 20 20		5 6 6	3 9 9	5 3 2									
1 26 27	2 28 28	$h = 4, k = 15$	6 3 2	4 3 2	6 5 4									
2 67 68	3 13 13	0 2 2	7 10 11	5 1 2	7 5 5									
3 22 22	4 20 20	1 6 6	8 3 3	6 1 1										
4 26 26	5 20 20	2 6 6	9 3 3	7 8 8	$h = 5, k = 11$									
5 20 20	6 24 23	3 9 9		8 1 1	0 55 55									
6 42 42	7 7 6	4 2 2	$h = 5, k = 3$		1 3 3									
7 13 13	8 17 17	5 2 1	0 50 52	$h = 5, k = 7$	2 6 6									
8 12 12			1 3 2	9 38 39	3 3 2									
9 13 13	$h = 4, k = 11$	$h = 4, k = 16$	2 39 41	1 19 19	4 47 48									
$h = 4, k = 7$	0 7 7	0 7 7	3 3 3	2 14 14	5 5 6									
	1 20 20	1 9 9	4 38 40	3 13 13	6 3 3									
0 21 20	2 6 5	2 23 24	5 2 2	4 34 34										
1 2 2	3 19 19	3 12 12	6 24 26	5 18 18	$h = 5, k = 12$									
2 7 7	4 5 5		7 3 2	6 13 13	0 3 0									
3 2 2	5 15 15	$h = 4, k = 17$	8 21 23	7 6 6	1 4 4									
4 15 15	6 2 2		9 1 1	8 25 26	2 4 4									
5 4 3	7 13 13	0 3 3			3 0 1									
6 8 7		1 10 10	$h = 5, k = 4$	$h = 5, k = 8$	4 1 0									
7 3 3	$h = 4, k = 12$													
8 5 6	0 29 29	$h = 5, k = 0$	0 9 10	0 6 6	5 7 6									
9 2 2	1 19 19	1 9 8	1 11 12	1 5 5	6 3 2									
$h = 4, k = 8$	2 40 40	3 2 1	2 5 5	2 19 20	$h = 5, k = 13$									
	3 20 20	5 10 10	3 6 6	3 3 3										
0 36 36	4 23 23	7 3 2	4 6 6	4 7 6	0 9 9									
1 21 21	5 14 14	9 7 6	5 11 12	5 6 6	1 0 1									
2 30 29	6 28 28		6 0 0	6 11 11	2 26 26									
3 12 12	7 16 16	$h = 5, k = 1$	7 2 2	7 2 1	3 3 3									
4 31 30			8 2 2	8 7 7	4 10 10									
5 20 20	$h = 4, k = 13$	0 39 40	9 7 7		5 4 3									
6 23 23	1 33 34			$h = 5, k = 9$										
7 4 4	2 26 27	$h = 5, k = 5$		0 30 32	$h = 5, k = 14$									
8 22 22	3 35 36	0 0 2	1 9 9	1 40	0 15 15									
	4 32 34	1 25 26	2 39 40		1 4 4									

$h=5, k=14$	$h=6, k=3$	$h=6, k=7$	$h=6, k=13$	$h=7, k=4$	$h=7, k=9$
$\ell F_0 F_C$					
2 4 4	2 1 2	6 11 11	0 12 12	0 2 3	2 25 25
3 2 3	3 8 8	7 7 7	1 3 2	1 6 6	3 5 4
4 11 12	4 2 0		2 4 4	2 4 4	4 4 4
	5 3 3	$h=6, k=8$	3 5 6	3 7 7	
$h=5, k=15$	6 2 1			4 2 2	$h=7, k=10$
	7 8 8	0 33 34	$h=6, k=14$	5 4 4	
0 24 25	1 29 30			6 1 1	0 6 6
1 9 10	2 20 20	0 30 30			1 4 3
2 23 25	3 31 32	1 22 22	$h=7, k=5$		2 2 1
3 10 11	4 29 30	2 9 9	3 2 2	3 2 2	
	0 60 61	5 21 21	0 9 9	4 5 5	
$h=5, k=16$	1 2 1	6 14 15	$h=7, k=0$	1 5 5	
0 3 4	2 6 6	7 24 25	1 6 6	2 45 43	$h=7, k=11$
	3 5 4			3 11 10	0 34 34
$h=6, k=0$	4 50 51	$h=6, k=9$	3 3 2		1 4 4
	5 2 2	5 8 7	4 8 8		2 7 8
0 21 20	0 4 4	7 3 1	5 1 1	3 8 9	
2 30 29	1 7 7		6 33 32		
4 19 18	8 33 33	2 7 7	$h=7, k=1$	$h=7, k=6$	$h=7, k=12$
6 25 24	3 0 1	0 43 40			
8 16 16	4 4 4	1 20 19	0 5 5	0 2 3	
	5 9 9	2 20 19	1 0 1	1 3 2	
$h=6, k=1$	0 7 7	3 13 12	2 4 4		
	1 13 13		3 4 4	$h=8, k=0$	
0 18 18	2 3 8	$h=6, k=10$	4 36 34		
1 13 13	3 14 15	5 20 19	4 4 4	0 32 29	
2 2 2	0 15 15	6 14 14	5 2 2	2 20 17	
3 8 8	1 7 7	7 6 6	6 4 3	4 28 25	
4 14 13	2 37 38			$h=7, k=7$	
5 14 13	3 9 9	$h=7, k=2$	0 31 31	$h=8, k=1$	
	4 12 13	4 2 2			
6 4 5	5 5 4	0 2 1	1 14 14	0 6 5	
7 4 4	$h=6, k=6$	1 6 6	2 24 23	1 14 13	
8 6 5	6 28 28	2 8 8	3 18 17	2 8 8	
		3 5 4	4 27 26	3 11 10	
$h=6, k=2$	1 5 4	$h=6, k=11$	0 31 31		
	2 14 14	4 2 2	4 2 2	4 4 3	
0 8 7	0 3 3	5 6 5	5 9 8	5 14 13	
1 24 24	1 8 8	6 5 5			
2 58 58	2 10 10	7 3 3	$h=7, k=8$	$h=8, k=2$	
3 18 17	3 6 6		0 10 10		
4 7 6	4 1 1	$h=7, k=3$	1 1 0	0 9 8	
5 22 22	5 8 8	0 24 23	2 4 3	1 9 8	
6 42 42	$h=6, k=7$	1 7 7	3 1 1	2 35 31	
7 10 10	$h=6, k=12$	2 11 10	4 8 8	3 10 9	
8 4 4	0 6 6		5 0 0	4 9 7	
	1 2 2	3 7 7		5 6 5	
$h=6, k=3$	2 18 18	4 24 22	$h=7, k=9$	$h=8, k=3$	
	3 6 6	5 6 6			
0 0 0	2 28 28	6 12 11	0 3 3		
1 2 2	3 2 1		1 4 4	0 12 10	
	4 6 6	6 12 11		1 4 3	

$h = 8, k = 3$   
 $\begin{matrix} l & F_O & F_C \end{matrix}$

2 10 9  
3 3 3  
4 10 9

$h = 8, k = 4$

0 35 31  
1 2 2  
2 7 7  
3 4 3  
4 31 28

$h = 8, k = 5$

0 14 13  
1 5 5  
2 2 1  
3 7 6  
4 11 10

$h = 8, k = 6$

0 22 20  
1 7 6  
2 24 22  
3 6 6

$h = 8, k = 7$

0 3 1  
1 11 11  
2 13 12  
3 14 13

$h = 8, k = 8$

0 22 20  
1 15 14  
2 15 15

$h = 9, k = 1$

0 18 15































H	K	L	F(OBS)	F(CALC)	A(CALC)	B(CALC)	DELTA F	DELTA/SIGMA	EXT. FACTOR	
7	1	6	45.369	44.069	44.158	3.480	1.240	6.2062	0.9898	
7	1	1	24.224	24.674	-2.159	-2.159	-2.0956	0.9976	971	
7	1	2	23.272	23.487	3.571	-0.215	-0.9504	0.9976	972	
7	1	3	17.936	17.670	17.560	2.083	0.265	1.1124	0.9986	973
7	1	4	36.732	37.550	37.528	3.536	-0.818	-3.5269	0.9933	974
7	1	5	24.052	23.997	-23.945	-2.038	0.055	0.2234	0.9971	975
7	1	6	18.527	17.864	17.577	3.279	0.753	2.9680	0.9983	976
7	0	5	9.355	9.350	9.314	0.954	-0.005	-0.0155	0.9995	977
7	0	6	4.654	4.356	-4.269	-0.866	0.259	0.6234	0.9999	980
7	0	7	8.538	8.314	8.261	0.555	0.224	0.7484	0.9997	981
8	0	0	39.355	36.565	36.392	4.912	2.790	11.8617	0.9915	982
8	0	1	16.595	17.147	17.076	1.679	-0.547	-1.9472	0.9986	983
8	1	2	10.412	10.092	10.089	0.330	0.320	0.9943	0.9995	984
8	1	3	16.428	16.615	-10.580	-0.901	-0.187	-0.6142	0.9995	985
8	1	4	13.915	13.385	-13.386	-0.305	0.530	2.1090	0.9993	986
8	1	5	1.900	*	2.387	0.832	-0.486	-0.3407	1.0000	987
8	2	0	6.700	6.359	6.396	1.457	0.141	0.4077	0.9998	988
8	2	1	9.643	10.003	9.977	0.748	-0.360	-1.2949	0.9996	989
8	2	2	35.691	39.596	39.210	5.025	0.295	1.2879	0.9932	990
8	2	3	10.987	10.644	-10.622	-0.730	0.343	1.1798	0.9995	991
8	3	0	1.550	*	1.511	1.465	-0.373	0.038	0.0331	992
8	3	1	11.836	11.423	11.363	0.990	0.413	1.5716	0.9994	993
8	3	2	14.084	12.879	-12.847	-0.989	1.205	4.8154	0.9991	995
8	4	0	40.994	39.072	38.940	4.841	1.923	8.7005	0.9915	996
8	4	1	5.235	4.176	-4.082	-0.884	1.059	2.6479	0.9999	997
8	4	2	5.837	6.382	6.179	1.599	-0.545	-1.5100	0.9998	998
8	4	3	6.214	5.608	5.536	0.896	0.606	1.6769	0.9999	999
8	5	2	1.500	*	1.285	-1.135	-0.603	0.215	0.1909	1.0000
8	5	3	4.673	2.875	2.832	-0.495	1.798	4.5549	1.0000	1001
8	5	4	15.162	15.012	15.004	0.734	0.150	0.6085	0.9987	1002
8	5	5	22.507	21.477	21.381	2.317	1.051	4.4234	0.9973	1003
8	6	1	10.306	9.384	9.290	1.342	0.922	3.4227	0.9996	1004

All reflections:

$$R = 3.2$$

Unrejected Reflections:  $R = 2.9$ 

$$R_{wtd.} = 2.6$$